

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA  
CHARLOTTESVILLE DIVISION**

BABY DOE, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

-v.-

JOSHUA MAST, *et al.*,

Defendants.

CIVIL NO: 3:22-cv-00049-NKM-JCH

**PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO SEAL PLAINTIFFS' EXHIBITS A, B, F, I, J, L, M, N, AND  
R TO PLAINTIFFS' PRE-HEARING BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO SHOW  
CAUSE WHY DEFENDANT JOSHUA MAST AND HIS THIRD-PARTY  
REPRESENTATIVE JONATHAN MAST SHOULD NOT BE HELD IN CONTEMPT  
FOR VIOLATING THE COURT'S PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Plaintiffs, by counsel, respectfully move for leave to file under seal Plaintiffs' Exhibits A, B, F, I, J, L, M, N, and R to Plaintiffs' Pre-Hearing Brief in Support of Motion to Show Cause Why Defendant Joshua Mast and His Third-Party Representative Jonathan Mast Should Not be Held in Contempt for Violating the Court's Protective Order ("Plaintiffs' Pre-hearing Brief"), pursuant to Local Civil Rule 9 and this Court's Protective Order (ECF No. 26). In support thereof, Plaintiffs state as follows:

The Exhibits contain identifying information regarding Plaintiffs. Exhibits A, B, I, J, L, N contain numerous identifying photographs of Baby Doe. Exhibits F, M, and R contain references to Baby Doe using the name given to her by Defendants. Exhibit R contains additional identifying information about Baby Doe, including where in Afghanistan she was recovered and a description of her physical injuries. This Court has issued a Protective Order (ECF No. 26) allowing Plaintiffs, including Baby Doe, to proceed under pseudonyms, given the concern for their safety and that of other innocent non-parties, such as their family members.

Under the common law right of access to judicial records, documents should be sealed when a party's interest in keeping the information contained therein confidential outweighs the presumed right of public access. *See, e.g. Stone v. Univ. of Maryland Med. Sys. Corp.*, 855 F.2d 178 (4th Cir. 1988); *Ashcroft v. Conoco, Inc.*, 218 F.3d 288, 302 (4th Cir. 2000). "Courts have recognized that an interest in protecting the physical and psychological well-being of individuals related to the litigation, including family members and particularly minors, may justify restricting access" to court documents. *United States v. Harris*, 890 F.3d 480, 492 (4th Cir. 2018); *see also United States v. Doe*, 962 F.3d 139, 147 (4th Cir. 2020). In this instance, the threats to the safety of the Plaintiffs and other innocent non-parties are very real, and have been recognized by this Court's Protective Order (ECF No. 26).

Plaintiffs' Brief, which references the Exhibits, has been filed publicly. In addition, Plaintiffs have filed publicly redacted versions of Exhibits F and M, which contain few references to Baby Doe by name. Thus, the public is not wholly deprived of an understanding of the general underlying factual basis for the request. The relief Plaintiffs seek in this Motion to Seal is narrowly tailored to the circumstances, and aims to seal only what is absolutely necessary to safeguard the safety of persons related to the litigation.

Accordingly, Plaintiffs request that Exhibits A, B, F, I, J, L, M, N, and R to Plaintiffs' Pre-hearing Brief be filed under seal, as the risks attendant to public disclosure of these documents is not likely to dissipate over time. A proposed Order is attached as Exhibit A to this Motion.

Dated: May 15, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

*/s/ Maya Eckstein*  
Maya M. Eckstein (VSB No. 41413)  
Lewis F. Powell III (VSB No. 18266)  
Kevin S. Elliker (VSB No. 87498)  
HUNTON ANDREWS KURTH LLP  
951 E Byrd St

Richmond, VA 23219  
Telephone: (804) 788-8200  
Fax: (804) 788-8218  
Email: [meckstein@HuntonAK.com](mailto:meckstein@HuntonAK.com)  
Email: [lpowell@HuntonAK.com](mailto:lpowell@HuntonAK.com)  
Email: [kelliker@HuntonAK.com](mailto:kelliker@HuntonAK.com)

Sehla Ashai (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
ELBIALLY LAW, PLLC  
704 East 15th Street  
Suite 204  
Plano, TX 75074  
Telephone: (312) 659-0154  
Email: [ashai@elbiallylaw.com](mailto:ashai@elbiallylaw.com)

Blair Connelly (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
Zachary L. Rowen (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
LATHAM & WATKINS LLP  
1271 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, New York 10020  
Telephone: (212) 906-1200  
Facsimile: (212) 751-4864  
Email: [Blair.Connelly@lw.com](mailto:Blair.Connelly@lw.com)  
Email: [Zachary.Rowen@lw.com](mailto:Zachary.Rowen@lw.com)

Ehson Kashfipour (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
Damon R. Porter (*admitted pro hac vice*)  
LATHAM & WATKINS LLP  
555 Eleventh Street, N.W. Suite 1000  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Telephone: (202) 637-2200  
Facsimile: (202) 637-2201  
Email: [Ehson.Kashfipour@lw.com](mailto:Ehson.Kashfipour@lw.com)  
Email: [Damon.Porter@lw.com](mailto:Damon.Porter@lw.com)  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on the 15th day of May 2024, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send a notification of such filing to all CM/ECF participants.

By: /s/ Maya M. Eckstein  
Maya M. Eckstein (VSB # 41413)  
Hunton Andrews Kurth LLP  
Riverfront Plaza, East Tower  
951 East Byrd Street  
Richmond, Virginia 23219-4074  
Telephone: (804) 788-8200  
Facsimile: (804) 788-8218  
meckstein@HuntonAK.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*